

Developing A1 Level Turkish as a Foreign Language Learners' Discriminational Listening Skills

Görkem ARSLAN* and Selcen ÇİFCİ

Department of Turkish Teaching, Usak University, Türkiye

Corresponding Author: Görkem Arslan, E-mail: gorkemyasar8826@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article history

Received: June 02, 2023

Accepted: July 09, 2023

Published: July 31, 2023

Volume: 11 Issue: 3

Conflicts of interest: None

Funding: None

Publication Note: This article reports the results of a thesis, titled "The Use of Podcast to Develop Discriminational Listening Skills of Turkish Learners Abroad: A1 Level" conducted by Görkem ARSLAN under the supervision of Selcen ÇİFCİ.

ABSTRACT

Listening skill, which is known to be in a mutual relationship with reading aloud, reading comprehension, and pronunciation, manifests itself in the form of discriminative listening skill in the case of true beginners who have started to learn a foreign language. The aim of this research is to present learning outcomes aimed at improving the discriminative listening skills of A1-level students learning Turkish abroad. In this research, which was carried out with the screening model, one of the qualitative research methods, first of all, the literature was examined. Afterwards, a pool of learning outcomes that can be used within the scope of discriminative listening skill in teaching Turkish as a foreign language was created. This pool of suggestions was obtained by exchanging ideas through online meetings between the researchers and three experts. The suggestion pool consists of 20 objectives, which were emailed to eight experts for validation. The collected data were analyzed through Lawshe Rule calculations. After these stages, the data were reduced to eight objectives. The results have useful implications for the field of Turkish as a foreign language learning.

Key words: Turkish as a Foreign Language, Listening, Parsing Listening, Reading, Reading Aloud, Pronunciation

INTRODUCTION

The natural acquisition process of language begins with listening. A healthy human baby begins to learn language by being exposed to linguistic stimuli from the mother's womb, primarily to the voices and speech of its mother, father, and immediate surroundings. The listening process, which starts with hearing in the mother's womb, maintains its importance throughout life, even in the first years after the birth of the baby. The birth of speech, which starts as the basic linguistic production process in babies and children, occurs when they turn the language inputs obtained through listening into communicative outputs. The child strengthens the initial outputs of their brain, nurtured by listening in the first years of life, and ensures their intellectual development. Most formal and informal learning is done through listening.

As an individual reaches school age, formal learning intensifies, and language acquisition takes on a systematic form, blending with the development of reading skills. After completing the initial literacy process, individuals acquire linguistic elements not only through listening but also through reading. They learn to communicate and produce language not only through speaking but also through writing. As skills blend in the language acquisition process,

the linguistic input-output network becomes more complex, and brain and thought development gradually shift to a form capable of performing complex tasks and reasoning on more abstract issues.

As explained above, listening skill, which forms the basis of other language skills, is the most frequently used language skill in daily life at every stage (Doğan, 2010, p. 264). According to studies (Imhof, 1998), listening is the most used language skill in the classroom. Through listening, individuals interact with their environment, take steps towards acquiring new knowledge and skills, and start acquiring language. In addition to its importance in acquiring the native language, listening skill plays a key role in learning a foreign language. According to Vandergrift (2007), listening skill is at the heart of language learning. According to Krashen (1982), input is the most important factor in the language acquisition process, and language acquisition occurs naturally when there is enough comprehensible input. Listening is the first way we receive these inputs, and we begin to acquire language through what we listen to. When exposed to high-quality stimuli, individuals create the mental foundation of the language they want to acquire through listening. It is important to note that there is no hierarchical structure

among language skills. Language skills do not present a hierarchical structure; they have an integrated structure.

Listening and reading skills are used in the process of receiving input in language acquisition. Studies that reveal the interrelationship between reading and listening skills suggest that a good reader is also a good listener. Duker (1964) states that nearly 200 features are shared in the mutual determining relationship between listening and reading skills, which are receptive language skills (Duker, 1964). In fact, Aarnoutse et al. (1998) determined through experimental research that improving listening skills would have an effect on improving reading skills. Despite studies supporting the argument that listening skill is stronger in the first years of school life but reading replaces listening skill over time (Diakidoy et al., 2005), studies have already been conducted that show that listening skill can remain as important as reading skill when appropriate teaching methods are designed and implemented (Schumer, 1990; Royer et al., 2005). Studies (Çapan & Karaca, 2013; Altunkaya, 2017) pointing to meaningful relationships between listening and reading anxiety also support the relationship between listening skills and reading skills.

Discriminative listening is also present in foreign language learning in various dimensions. According to some researchers, discriminative listening is the key to acquiring a foreign language (Bohlken & Macias, 1992). In the acquisition of a foreign language, the initial stage of listening skill is “discriminative listening skill,” which involves distinguishing sounds, words, accents, sentences, non-verbal stimuli, and meanings. In discriminative listening, individuals initially exhibit sensitivity to both verbal and non-verbal cues, and it serves as a foundation for other types of listening (Stewart & Arnold, 2018). If listening, the natural and primary way of learning, is performed more frequently while learning a foreign language—just like when acquiring a native language—this will facilitate the steps that an individual will take while learning a foreign language. Just as the frequency and intensity of linguistic stimuli from the immediate environment are important for a baby’s speech development, the amount of exposure to vocal and verbal linguistic stimuli is equally important for an individual learning a foreign language. Differentiating sounds, words, sentences, stress, intonation, and finally meanings are essential for acquiring a language.

Numerous studies in the literature support this idea. Lund (1991), in an experimental research with a group of students learning German as a second language, concluded that among the students who tried to make sense of the same text through reading and listening, those in the listening group perceived and tried to decipher individual words from the text they listened to. Ilkhamovna (2023), expressing that listening provides the individual with background knowledge to be a good reader, states that listening can support reading in many ways. Tsuda et al. (2023) also report that a curriculum consisting of a combination of reading and listening skills helps develop all skills and motivates students to become independent learners in acquiring a foreign language. These relationships between listening and reading skills clearly reveal the importance of listening and reading skills in acquiring and learning a foreign language.

In the “General Approach” section of the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (2013), which defines the A1 level with the word “breakthrough,” the perspective on listening skills in the language learning process becomes clearer (2013, p. 143). This study is based on the view that listening activities at the A1 level should aim to create awareness of the learned language and acquaint learners with the language, in accordance with the approach of the Framework Text.

Looking at the place of listening in foreign language learning, there are different approaches in terms of listening types. According to Sampson et al. (2003), listening can be categorized into nine “levels” or “stages” that go beyond the classification found in the literature. These stages include simple listening, discriminative listening, interpretive listening, listening for information, listening to organize ideas, listening for main ideas, listening for different perspectives, critical listening, and creative listening (Sampson et al., 2003). This approach is significant in expressing that listening is a mental process that develops gradually.

The first step in discriminative listening, which is less emphasized in the literature (Melanlıoğlu, 2012), is the discrimination of sounds. This element of discriminative listening is included in the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (2013, p. 108) as “recognizing and combining unfamiliar sound sequences.” The discriminative listening process includes distinguishing distinctive phonemes, supra-segmental phonemes, morphemes, and syntax (Bohlken & Macias, 1992, p. 1). The development of discriminative listening is essential not only for sound awareness, pronunciation, and production but also for comprehension.

Discriminative listening is considered a superstructure for other types of listening and forms the basis for all types of listening (Welch & Mickelson, 2013, p. 86). Discriminative listening is seen as the starting point for learning a second language because during childhood and human evolution, humans begin by discriminating human voices followed by other features of human language such as sounds, accents, pauses, etc. (Raju, 2018). When starting to learn a foreign language, it is necessary to “retrain the ear” (Bobadilla, 1982) in order to overcome the filters created by the habits of the native language.

Although there is no specific skill called discriminative listening skill in the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (2018), it is described in the descriptors under the title of “General Verbal Comprehension” for pre-A1 and A1 levels. These descriptors include:

- Can follow very slow and carefully spoken speech with long pauses to understand the meaning.
- Can recognize concrete information (e.g., places and times) on familiar topics encountered in daily life, provided that the speech is slow and clear.
- Can understand short, very simple questions and statements, provided that the speech is slow and clear, supported by visuals and gestures to aid understanding, and repeated if necessary.

- Can recognize everyday, familiar words/signs when they are presented clearly and slowly in a familiar everyday context.
- Can recognize numbers, prices, dates, and days of the week when they are presented slowly and clearly in a familiar everyday context.

These descriptors capture the skills at the core of discriminative listening. Furthermore, the ability to “recognize already familiar words/signs, names, and numbers in simple and short recordings, provided they are spoken very slowly and clearly” and the skill defined as “Understanding audio (or sign language) media content and recordings” at the pre-A1 level also highlight the importance of discriminative listening skills.

Discriminative listening skills begin to emerge in the first basic listening stage when the capacity for hearing and auditory attention, developed through distinguishing familiar sounds from the mother’s womb, evolves into listening by discriminating the unique sound and word structures of the language. In acquiring a foreign language, we need to take this initial step again for the new language and make sense of its specific sounds, words, morphological and syntactic structures in order to decipher it. Our discriminative listening skills are developed for our native language, but if we don’t follow the right path in learning a new language, it can hinder progress. In fact, each individual tries to adapt the target language to the sounds and structures of their native language while learning a new language. The “Turks speak too fast” complaint from those learning Turkish as a foreign language, as mentioned by Arslan and Batur (2021, p. 14), indicates that the “superstructure” created by this discriminative listening skill has not been sufficiently utilized. Developing this superstructure will accelerate and support the language acquisition process. Listening is a skill that supports reading, as mentioned in the sample studies above. Additionally, the discriminative listening skill, used to distinguish the sounds and general characteristics of a language, will also help learners gain background knowledge about the language.

Understanding the general morphology, syntax, and words of a language not only forms the basis for reading comprehension but also for reading aloud and pronunciation. Learners who can correctly discriminate the sounds and words of the language will read and understand texts accurately.

Objectives and Research Questions

The aim of this study is to present learning outcomes aimed at improving the discriminative listening skills of A1-level students learning Turkish abroad. The research focuses on enhancing discriminative listening skills in teaching Turkish as a foreign language. To address this focus, the following research questions were examined:

- What are the sources for creating acquisitions to develop discriminative listening skills in teaching Turkish as a foreign language?
- What are the gains based on expert opinions and field research on discriminative listening skills in teaching Turkish as a foreign language?

METHOD

Model of the Research

This research aims to provide suggestions for improving discriminative listening skills in teaching Turkish as a foreign language. It is a qualitative research study conducted using a screening model. Qualitative research involves using data collection techniques such as observation, interviews, and document analysis to reveal perceptions and events in a natural environment in a realistic and holistic manner (Karataş, 2015). The research model employed in this study is documentary screening, which is a type of survey research involving the process of finding, reading, taking notes, and evaluating resources for a specific purpose (Karasar, 2012, p. 183).

Process

In this study, the literature was reviewed to address the research problem. Based on the literature, a pool of learning outcomes for improving discriminative listening skills in teaching Turkish as a foreign language was created. This pool of outcomes was generated through online meetings involving a faculty member, a lecturer, and a teacher, along with researchers working in the field of Turkish language teaching. A suggestion pool consisting of 20 learning outcomes was compiled and emailed to a total of eight experts for validation. The experts’ feedback was collected using an expert opinion form, which included three columns: outcome suggestions, the source on which the suggestion was based, and an expert opinion box with options for “accepted, rejected, requires revision, your suggestion.” The data collected from the experts were analyzed using the Lawshe Rule calculations. Following this analysis, eight objectives were retained. The results of the study have practical implications for the field of Turkish language learning.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

This section presents the findings obtained from the research and provides explanations based on these findings.

Findings and Recommendations for the First Research Question

The first research question focused on identifying the sources for creating learning outcomes aimed at improving discriminative listening skills in teaching Turkish as a foreign language. To address this sub-question, a pool of outcome proposals was created by examining domestic and foreign theses, articles, and papers in the literature. Appendix 1, titled “A1 Level Outcome Suggestions Pool for Developing Discriminative Listening Skills in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language,” was generated based on the literature review. Upon reviewing Appendix 1, it is evident that the learning outcomes aim to raise awareness about language from sounds to sentences. The proposed outcomes, derived from the literature, emphasize sound awareness, the ability to discriminate words, and understanding judgments composed of words.

Findings and Recommendations for the Second Research Question

The second research question aimed to explore the gains based on expert opinions and field research regarding discriminative listening skills in teaching Turkish as a foreign language. As mentioned earlier, seven learning outcomes were accepted by all experts as suitable for the target level and skill, while one outcome was revised. Appendix 2, based on expert opinions, presents the learning outcomes and the experts' perspectives on these learning outcomes. Please refer to Appendix 2.

The expert opinion form was sent to eight experts, including six experts actively working in the field of teaching Turkish as a foreign language and one program development specialist in educational sciences. The experts provided their opinions on each outcome, choosing from options such as "accepted," "rejected," or "requires revision," and offered explanations for their opinions when necessary. The researcher examined the expert opinions and calculated the content validity of the outcome items according to the Lawshe Technique. According to this technique, for an item to be considered appropriate, at least seven out of eight experts must find it suitable (Ayre & Scally, 2014). The outcome set, which underwent evaluation by experts using the Lawshe Technique and was informed by the literature review, includes the following:

- Ability to discriminate letters corresponding to sounds while listening.
- Ability to discriminate words while listening.
- Ability to discriminate suffixes that can fit a word while listening.
- Ability to discriminate words starting with the same sound while listening.
- Ability to discriminate words ending with the same sound while listening.
- Ability to discriminate between correctly and incorrectly pronounced sounds while listening.
- Ability to discriminate the aspirated sounds while listening.
- Ability to discriminate similar and different sounds from different sources (e.g., male, female, child's voice; digital source, phone, or any audio device, etc.)*

The learning outcome marked with "*" was revised based on expert opinions, while the other acquisitions were retained as they were found appropriate by the experts. It is worth noting that sound awareness is emphasized within the outcome set. While knowledge of the phonological structure of a foreign language is not essential for learning the target language, developing an understanding of the target language's phonological structure and becoming familiar with it in general terms is a prerequisite for learning a new language.

Two other important elements in the outcome set are the ability to discriminate words and suffixes. Among the candidate learning outcomes presented to the experts, they focused on outcomes related to sound, suffix, and word awareness.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Duker (1965) considers discriminative listening as "auditory discrimination" and states that while listening is a prerequisite, it cannot be included within the scope of listening skill. However, more recent research views discriminative listening as the most basic form of listening skill. Aguila and Linares (2020) define discriminative listening as the fundamental type of listening skill that children acquire in their early years and continue to use throughout their lives, while Nagendra (2014) sees discriminative listening as a fundamental skill used in language acquisition from a broader perspective. Thus, discriminative listening makes individuals sensitive to a language by enabling them to discriminate between different language sounds (Vega, 2021). This skill, which involves becoming familiar with the sounds, words, and general usage of a language, improves with increased exposure to the target language. For example, a foreigner living in Slovakia develops a general awareness of Slovak sounds, words, and sentence structures before deciphering the meaning of the spoken language around them. Once this awareness is developed, the individual becomes acquainted with the language and gradually starts learning frequently heard words from sentences and conversations. In other words, individuals initially discriminate verbal and non-verbal cues that form the complex structure of spoken language through discriminative listening, and then they proceed to the language learning phase using these cues.

Melanlioğlu (2012, p. 58) states, "Considering the listening process that begins in the womb, it can be said that discriminative listening is the first type of listening used. This genre, which includes discriminating and making sense of sounds, holds a very important place in acquiring other skills." When learning a foreign language, there is a need for learning processes and acquisitions that develop discriminative listening skills to achieve sound awareness and interpretation of the target language, thereby "retraining the ear" for the target language and acclimatizing it to the new language. Based on this need, this research aims to present acquisition suggestions for improving discriminative listening skills in teaching Turkish as a foreign language. The findings of the research, based on literature review and expert opinions, reveal that experts in the field focus on three main aspects of discriminative listening in teaching Turkish as a foreign language at the A1 level: noticing sounds, noticing words, and noticing suffixes. Consequently, it can be concluded that discriminative listening in teaching Turkish as a foreign language starts with sound, affix, and word awareness.

These aspects of discriminative listening theoretically support the assumption that there is a relationship between reading aloud and discriminative listening. Further research is needed to empirically investigate the relationship between discriminative listening and reading aloud skills.

In the context of discriminative listening, the different dimensions of discriminative listening in teaching Turkish as a foreign language at A2, A2+, B1, B2+, and C1 levels, its relationship with reading skills and pronunciation, or the effect of acquiring discriminative listening skills at the beginner

level on learning Turkish as a foreign language at other levels can be examined.

REFERENCES

- Aarnoutse, C. A. J., Van den Bos, K. P. & Brand-Gruwel, S. (1998). Effects of listening comprehension training on listening and reading. *The Journal of Special Education*, 32(2), 115-126. <https://doi.org/10.1177/002246699803200206>
- Aguila, A., & Linares, D. (2020). La habilidad escuchar: fundamentos para su desarrollo en docentes de la Educación Superior. *Revista ROCA, Volume 16*, 1356-1367. Retrieved from <https://dialnet.unirioja.es/servlet/articulo?codigo=8372416>
- Altunkaya, H. (2017). Listening and Reading Concerns Of Learning Turkish as a Foreign Language. *Education Sciences*, 12(3), 107-121. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/nwsaedu/issue/30288/300770>
- Arslan, G., & Batur, Z. (2021). The Views of Students Learning Turkish as a Foreign Language on Turkish, Turkey and Turkish Culture: The Case of Slovakia Matej Bel University. *International Journal of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language*, 4(1), 4-30. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/ijotfl/issue/63209/845561>
- Ayre, C., & Scally A. J. (2014). Critical values for Lawshe's content validity ratio: revisiting the original methods of calculation. *Measurement and Evaluation in Counseling and Development*, 47(1), 79-86. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0748175613513808>
- Bobadilla, F. (1982). La discriminación auditiva y la enseñanza de lenguas extranjeras. *Lenguas Modernas*, 9(10), 83-103. <https://ultimadecada.uchile.cl/index.php/LM/article/view/45914>
- Bohlken, R., & Macias, L. (1992). What a nonnative speaker of English needs to learn through listening. *Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the International Listening Association, Seattle, WA*. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED350637).
- Capan, S.A., & Karaca, M. (2013). A Comparative Study of Listening Anxiety and Reading Anxiety. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 70, 1360-1373. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.01.198>.
- Diakidoy, A., Stylianou, P., Karefillidou, C., & Papageorgiou, P. (2005) The Relationship Between Listening And Reading Comprehension Of Different Types Of Text At Increasing Grade Levels, *Reading Psychology*, 26(1), 55-80, <https://doi.org/10.1080/02702710590910584>
- Doğan, Y. (2010). Using activities to improve listening skills. *Turkology Studies*, 27, 263-274. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/tubar/issue/16968/177233>
- Duker, S. (1964). Chapter III: Listening *Review of Educational Research*, 34(2), 156-163. <https://doi.org/10.3102/00346543034002156>
- Duker, S. (1965). Listening and reading. *The Elementary School Journal*, 65(6), 321-329. <https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/epdf/10.1086/460227>
- Er, O., Bicer, N. & Bozkırlı, K. C. (2012). Evaluation of Problems Encountered in Teaching Turkish to Foreigners in the Light of Related Literature. *International Journal of Turkish Literature, Culture and Education (TEKE)*, 1(2), 51-69. <https://doi.org/10.7884/teke.51>
- Fry, D. B. (1971). *Speed reception and perception*. In Lyons, J. (Ed.), *New Horizons In Linguistics*. Pelican Books.
- Ilkhamovna, B. M. (2023). Importance Of Teaching Reading And Listing In English Lessons. *Models And Methods For Increasing The Efficiency Of Innovative Research*, 2(19), 98-101. <https://zienjournals.com/index.php/jpip/article/view/449>
- Imhof, M. (1998). What makes a good listener? Listening behavior in instructional settings. *International Journal of Listening*, 12(1), 81-105. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10904018.1998.10499020>
- Karasar, N. (2012). *Scientific research method*. Nobel Publications.
- Khomeniuk, A. (2020). A study on teaching Turkish as a foreign language in Ukraine and the problems encountered. *International Journal of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language*, 3(1), 5-20. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/ijotfl/issue/50307/617644>
- Krashen, S. D. (1982). *Principles and practice in second language acquisition*. Pergamon Publication.
- Lund, R. J. (1991). A comparison of second language listening and reading comprehension. *The Modern Language Journal*, 75(2), 196-204. <https://doi.org/10.2307/328827>
- Melanlıoğlu, D. (2012). An activity proposal to develop discriminative listening in Turkish teaching. *National Education*, 41(196), 56 - 68. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/milliegitim/issue/36171/406672>
- Ministry of National Education Board of Education (2013). *Common European Framework of Reference for Languages, Learning-Teaching Evaluation (Translation into Turkish with the consent of the Council of Europe)*. Türkiye Directorate of State Books Revolving Fund.
- Ministry of National Education Board of Education (2018). *Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, Teaching, Assessment Companion Volume with New Descriptors (Translation into Turkish with the consent of the Council of Europe)*. Türkiye Directorate of State Books Revolving Fund.
- Nagendra, K. (2014). Listening as a basic skill of communication. *Journal of Business Management Social Science Research (JBM&SSR)*, 3(4), 31.
- Okatan, H. I. (2012). Turkish Language Learning Problems of Foreign Students Studying at Police Academy. *Faculty of Security Sciences. Journal of Police Sciences*, 14(4). <https://search.trdizin.gov.tr/tr/yayin/detay/139546>
- Raju, C. P. (2018). Types of listening skills: Barriers and tips to overcome them. *International Journal of Advanced Multidisciplinary Scientific Research (IJAMSR ISSN: 2581-4281)*, 1(2), 41-45. https://www.ijamsr.com/issues/6_Volume%201_Issue%202/20180505_045545_7.pdf
- Royer, J. M., Sinatra, G. M., & Schumer, H. (1990). Patterns of individual differences in the development of listening and reading comprehension. *Contemporary Educational Psychology*, 15, 183-196. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0361-476X\(90\)90016-T](https://doi.org/10.1016/0361-476X(90)90016-T)

- Sampson, M. B., Rasinski, T. V., & Sampson, M. (2003). *Total literacy. Reading, writing, and learning*. Thomson-Wadsworth.
- Sengul, K. (2014). Alphabet Problem in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language. *International Journal of Turkish Literature, Culture and Education (TEKE)*, 3(1), 325-339. <https://doi.org/10.7884/teke.245>
- Stewart, M. C., & Arnold, C. L. (2018). Defining social listening: Recognizing an emerging dimension of listening. *International Journal of Listening*, 32(2), 85-100. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10904018.2017.1330656>
- Szabo, S., Sawatsky, R., & Blaylock, J. (2016). Developing awesome listeners and speakers: Using oral language activities and question stems to promote literacy and learning. *Literacy Summit Yearbook*, 2, 25-31. Literacy Professionals & Texas Association for Literacy Education.
- Tsuda, K., Muramatsu, N., Renandya, W. A., & Jacobs, G. M. (2023). Combining extensive reading while listening (ERWL) with cooperative learning. *Journal of Applied Linguistics and Literature*, 8(1), 125-145. <https://doi.org/10.33369/joall.v8i1.26128>
- Vandergrift, L. (2007). Recent developments in second and foreign language listening comprehension research. *Language Teaching*, 40(3), 191-210. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0261444807004338>
- Vega, W. P. C. (2021). *Audiovisual didactic resources to boost A1 students' discriminative listening skills*. [Unpublished Master Thesis]. Pontificia Universidad Católica del Ecuador.
- Welch, S. A., & Mickelson, W. T. (2013). A listening competence comparison of working professionals. *International Journal of Listening*, 27(2), 85-99. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10904018.2013.783344>

APPENDIX

Appendix 1. A1 level learning outcome suggestions pool for developing discriminative listening skills in turkish as a foreign language

Learning Outcome Suggestions	The Sources of The Learning Outcome Suggestions
Ability to discriminate between correctly and incorrectly pronounced sounds while listening.	Common European Framework for Recommendations for Languages (2013, p. 135): "If language learners are made aware of pronunciation mistakes later and only then start to abandon their usual behaviors, a situation may arise that is more difficult in terms of time and effort than correcting mistakes in the first stage of language learning. This situation can be particularly challenging when learners need to align their pronunciation with the norms of their native language, which is often the case with young learners." native language
Ability to discriminate the letters corresponding to the sounds while listening.	In the studies conducted in the field of teaching Turkish as a foreign language, it has been found that students have difficulties with letters such as ö, ü, ğ, ç, ı, j (Khomenuk, 2020; Arslan & Batur, 2021; Okatan, 2012; Er, Biçer & Bozkırlı, 2012; Sengul, 2014). As a teacher-researcher, I observed during Turkish lessons at the institution where this research was conducted that although some students can understand short texts prepared at the basic level after 8 to 11 weeks of Turkish lesson experience, they still have difficulty in discriminating and pronouncing the relevant letters. These findings and experiences from the field are examples that highlight the need for the development of discriminative listening skills, which play a crucial role in the development of pronunciation skills.
Ability to discriminate similar and different sounds from various sources while listening.	1. The first step in discriminative listening, which is the least emphasized type in the literature (Melanlıoğlu, 2012), is the discrimination of sounds. This element of discriminative listening is included in the European Common Framework of Reference for Languages (2013, p. 108) as "recognizing and combining unfamiliar sound sequences with each other". 2. Discriminative listening makes the listener sensitive to language (Nagendra, 2014) and enables them to hear and identify the similarities and differences in sounds (Szabo et al., 2016, p. 26).
Ability to discriminate sentences while listening.	The discriminative listening process involves distinguishing distinctive phonemes, suprasegmental phonemes, morphemes, and syntax in a sequential manner (Bohlken & Macias, 1992, p. 1).
Ability to discriminate the dotted sounds while listening.	According to the Framework (2013, p. 135), "Many phonemes can be easily transferred from L1 to L2. In some cases, sounds used in a particular phonological setting are clearly discriminable from one another. Some phonemes in L2 may not be available in L1. If these phonemes are not acquired or learned, this can lead to a loss of information or possible conflicts. How often can such situations occur, and how important are they? A more complex situation arises when language habits are established in phonological learning at the age and learning stage when they are best learned. If language learners are made aware of pronunciation mistakes later and only then start to give up their habitual behaviors, a situation may arise that is more difficult in terms of time and effort than correcting mistakes in the first stage of language learning." The first step in discriminative listening, which is the least emphasized type in the literature (Melanlıoğlu, 2012), is the discrimination of sounds. This element of discriminative listening is included in the European Common Recommendations Framework for Languages (2013, p. 108) as "recognizing and combining unfamiliar sound sequences with each other." native language

(Contd...)

Appendix 1. (Continued)

Learning Outcome Suggestions	The Sources of The Learning Outcome Suggestions
Ability to discriminate words while listening.	1. The process of discriminative listening: distinctive phonemes, suprasegmental phonemes, morphemes, and syntax follow the sequence (Bohlken & Macias, 1992, p. 1). 2. When starting to learn a foreign language, it is necessary to "retrain the ear" (Bobadilla, 1982) in order to eliminate the filters created by the habits of the native language. This training first starts at the phoneme level and follows a process of: a. Processing detected sounds through a decoding mechanism, b. Combining the sound rules of the learned language with the processed sounds, c. Predicting phoneme sequences based on linguistic knowledge, d. Dividing the phoneme chain into morphemes and applying morphemic restrictions (combining and adapting audible sounds with the syllable formation rules of the target language), f. Forming words based on a chain of morphemes, g. Forming word strings.
Ability to discriminate syllables while listening.	Melanlioglu (2012) limited discriminative listening to the discrimination of sounds by considering it based on phonological awareness. However, the discriminative listening process involves distinctive phonemes, suprasegmental phonemes, morphemes, and syntax, following a sequence (Bohlken & Macias, 1992, p. 1).
Ability to discriminate phonemes while listening.	According to the Framework (2013, p. 135), "Many phonemes can be easily transferred from L1 to L2. In some cases, sounds used in a particular phonological setting are clearly discriminable from one another. Some phonemes in L2 may not be available in L1. If these phonemes are not acquired or learned, this can lead to a loss of information or possible conflicts. How often do such situations occur, and how important are they? A more complex situation arises when language habits are established in phonological learning at the age and learning stage when they are best learned. If language learners become aware of pronunciation mistakes only later and then start to give up their habitual behaviors, a situation may arise that is more difficult in terms of time and effort than correcting mistakes in the first stage of language learning."native language
Ability to discriminate the beginning and end of sentences while listening.	When starting to learn a foreign language, it is necessary to "retrain the ear" (Bobadilla, 1982) in order to eliminate the filters created by the habits of the native language. This training first starts at the phoneme level and follows a process of: a. Processing detected sounds through a decoding mechanism, b. Combining the sound rules of the learned language with the processed sounds, c. Predicting phoneme sequences based on linguistic knowledge, d. Dividing the phoneme chain into morphemes and applying morphemic restrictions (combining and adapting audible sounds with the syllable formation rules of the target language), f. Forming words based on a chain of morphemes, g. Forming word strings.
Ability to discriminate words while listening.	When starting to learn a foreign language, it is necessary to "retrain the ear" (Bobadilla, 1982) in order to eliminate the filters created by the habits of the native language. This training first starts at the phoneme level and follows a process of: a. Processing detected sounds through a decoding mechanism, b. Combining the sound rules of the learned language with the processed sounds, c. Predicting phoneme sequences based on linguistic knowledge, d. Dividing the phoneme chain into morphemes and applying morphemic restrictions (combining and adapting audible sounds with the syllable formation rules of the target language), f. Forming words based on a chain of morphemes, g. Forming word strings.
Ability to discriminate the number of words in a sentence while listening.	When starting to learn a foreign language, it is necessary to "retrain the ear" (Bobadilla, 1982) in order to eliminate the filters created by the habits of the native language. This training first starts at the phoneme level and follows a process of: a. Processing detected sounds through a decoding mechanism, b. Combining the sound rules of the learned language with the processed sounds, c. Predicting phoneme sequences based on linguistic knowledge, d. Dividing the phoneme chain into morphemes and applying morphemic restrictions (combining and adapting audible sounds with the syllable formation rules of the target language), f. Forming words based on a chain of morphemes, g. Forming word strings.
Ability to discriminate the number of sentences in a paragraph while listening.	When starting to learn a foreign language, it is necessary to "retrain the ear" (Bobadilla, 1982) in order to eliminate the filters created by the habits of the native language. This training first starts at the phoneme level and follows a process of:

(Contd...)

Appendix 1. (Continued)

Learning Outcome Suggestions	The Sources of The Learning Outcome Suggestions
Ability to discriminate words in a sentence while listening.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Processing detected sounds through a decoding mechanism, b. Combining the sound rules of the learned language with the processed sounds, c. Predicting phoneme sequences based on linguistic knowledge, d. Dividing the phoneme chain into morphemes and applying morphemic restrictions (combining and adapting audible sounds with the syllable formation rules of the target language), f. Forming words based on a chain of morphemes, g. Forming word strings. <p>When starting to learn a foreign language, it is necessary to "retrain the ear" (Bobadilla, 1982) in order to eliminate the filters created by the habits of the native language. This training first starts at the phoneme level and follows a process of:</p>
Ability to discriminate syllables in a word while listening.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Processing detected sounds through a decoding mechanism, b. Combining the sound rules of the learned language with the processed sounds, c. Predicting phoneme sequences based on linguistic knowledge, d. Dividing the phoneme chain into morphemes and applying morphemic restrictions (combining and adapting audible sounds with the syllable formation rules of the target language), f. Forming words based on a chain of morphemes, g. Forming word strings. <p>When starting to learn a foreign language, it is necessary to "retrain the ear" (Bobadilla, 1982) in order to eliminate the filters created by the habits of the native language. This training first starts at the phoneme level and follows a process of:</p>
Ability to discriminate suffixes in words while listening.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Processing detected sounds through a decoding mechanism, b. Combining the sound rules of the learned language with the processed sounds, c. Predicting phoneme sequences based on linguistic knowledge, d. Dividing the phoneme chain into morphemes and applying morphemic restrictions (combining and adapting audible sounds with the syllable formation rules of the target language), f. Forming words based on a chain of morphemes, g. Forming word strings. <p>When starting to learn a foreign language, it is necessary to "retrain the ear" (Bobadilla, 1982) in order to eliminate the filters created by the habits of the native language. This training first starts at the phoneme level and follows a process of:</p>
Ability to discriminate words that start with the same sound while listening.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Processing detected sounds through a decoding mechanism, b. Combining the sound rules of the learned language with the processed sounds, c. Predicting phoneme sequences based on linguistic knowledge, d. Dividing the phoneme chain into morphemes and applying morphemic restrictions (combining and adapting audible sounds with the syllable formation rules of the target language), f. Forming words based on a chain of morphemes, g. Forming word strings. <p>"In literacy, discriminative listening enables the listener to hear and identify similarities and differences in sounds. For example, high-low sounds in a musical scale, soft-loud sounds at the same pitch, long-short sounds with the same tones, words with the same initial sound, words with rhyming endings, words with the same sound in their inner syllables, and repeated words" (Sampson et al., 2003, pp. 97-98).</p>
Ability to discriminate words that end with the same sound while listening.	<p>"In literacy, discriminative listening enables the listener to hear and identify similarities and differences in sounds. For example, high-low sounds in a musical scale, soft-loud sounds at the same pitch, long-short sounds with the same tones, words with the same initial sound, words with rhyming endings, words with the same sound in their inner syllables, and repeated words" (Sampson et al., 2003, pp. 97-98).</p>
Ability to discriminate Turkish words among other words while listening.	<p>This suggestion is researcher's suggestion for the discriminative listening skill required to discriminate words. When starting to learn a foreign language, it is necessary to "retrain the ear" (Bobadilla, 1982) in order to eliminate the filters created by the habits of the native language. This training first starts at the phoneme level and follows a process of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Processing detected sounds through a decoding mechanism, b. Combining the sound rules of the learned language with the processed sounds, c. Predicting phoneme sequences based on linguistic knowledge, d. Dividing the phoneme chain into morphemes and applying morphemic restrictions (combining and adapting audible sounds with the syllable formation rules of the target language), f. Forming words based on a chain of morphemes, g. Forming word strings.

(Contd...)

Appendix 1. (Continued)

Learning Outcome Suggestions	The Sources of The Learning Outcome Suggestions
Ability to discriminate the suffix that can fit the word while listening.	When starting to learn a foreign language, it is necessary to "retrain the ear" (Bobadilla, 1982) in order to eliminate the filters created by the habits of the native language. This training first starts at the phoneme level and follows a process of: a. Processing detected sounds through a decoding mechanism, b. Combining the sound rules of the learned language with the processed sounds, c. Predicting phoneme sequences based on linguistic knowledge, d. Dividing the phoneme chain into morphemes and applying morphemic restrictions (combining and adapting audible sounds with the syllable formation rules of the target language), f. Forming words based on a chain of morphemes, g. Forming word strings.
Ability to discriminate stems and suffixes in a Turkish word.	When starting to learn a foreign language, it is necessary to "retrain the ear" (Bobadilla, 1982) in order to eliminate the filters created by the habits of the native language. This training first starts at the phoneme level and follows a process of: a. Processing detected sounds through a decoding mechanism, b. Combining the sound rules of the learned language with the processed sounds, c. Predicting phoneme sequences based on linguistic knowledge, d. Dividing the phoneme chain into morphemes and applying morphemic restrictions (combining and adapting audible sounds with the syllable formation rules of the target language), f. Forming words based on a chain of morphemes, g. Forming word strings. Melanlioglu (2012) limited discriminative listening to the discrimination of sounds by considering it based on phonological awareness. However, the discriminative listening process involves distinctive phonemes, suprasegmental phonemes, morphemes, and syntax, following a sequence (Bohlken & Macias, 1992, p. 1).

Appendix 2. Opinions of the experts on the learning outcome suggestions

Opinions	Experts							
	U1	U2	U3	U4	U5	U6	U7	U8
Ability to discriminate between correctly and incorrectly pronounced sounds while listening.	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
Ability to discriminate the letters corresponding to the sounds while listening.	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
Ability to discriminate similar and different sounds from various sources while listening.	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	+
Ability to discriminate sentences while listening.	-	-	+	+	-	+	-	+
Ability to discriminate the dotted sounds while listening.	+	-	+	+	+	+	-	+
Ability to discriminate words while listening.	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
Ability to discriminate syllables while listening.	+	-	+	+	-	-	-	+
Ability to discriminate phonemes while listening.	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+
Ability to discriminate the beginning and end of sentences while listening.	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	+
Ability to discriminate words while listening.	Requires revision	-	Requires revision	+	+	-	-	+
Ability to discriminate the number of words in a sentence while listening.	+	-	Requires revision	+	-	+	-	+
Ability to discriminate the number of sentences in a paragraph while listening.	+	-	-	+	-	-	-	+
Ability to discriminate words in a sentence while listening.	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	+
Ability to discriminate syllables in a word while listening.	+	-	+	+	-	Requires revision	-	+
Ability to discriminate suffixes in words while listening.	+	+	+	Requires revision	-	+	-	+

(Contd...)

Appendix 2. (Continued)

Opinions Learning Outcome Suggestions	Experts							
	U1	U2	U3	U4	U5	U6	U7	U8
Ability to discriminate words that start with the same sound while listening.	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	+
Ability to discriminate words that end with the same sound while listening.	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+
Ability to discriminate Turkish words among other words while listening.	-	-	-	Requires revision	-	+	+	+
Ability to discriminate the suffix that can fit the word while listening.	Requires revision	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
Ability to discriminate stems and suffixes in a Turkish word.	-	+	+	-	-	Requires revision	-	+