

International Journal of Education & Literacy Studies

ISSN: 2202-9478 www.ijels.aiac.org.au



Teachers' Views on Citizenship Subjects within the Context of Social Studies Literacy Regarding Identity Formation and Acquisition of Citizenship Awareness of Immigrant Students

Hasan Bozkaya*

Hatay Provincial Directorate of National Education, Hatay, Turkey

Corresponding author: Hasan Bozkaya, E-mail: bozkayahasan75@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article history

Received: June 25, 2021 Accepted: October 16, 2021 Published: October 31, 2021 Volume: 9 Issue: 4

Conflicts of interest: None

Funding: None

ABSTRACT

While immigrant students, who live in Turkey, have their own values at home, they encounter Turkish culture and values at school and in their social life. This situation brings along certain tensions in identity formation processes. Citizenship education aims to prepare students for social life by providing them with the necessary knowledge and skills to grow up as democratic citizens. Therefore, citizenship education has an important function in the identity formation of children. Therefore, citizenship education has an important function in the identity formation of children. The aim of this research is to determine teachers' views about citizenship subjects regarding identity formation and citizenship awareness in the context of social studies literacy. Case study, which is one of the qualitative research methods, was used in this study. Data was gathered via a semi-structured teacher interview form. The data of the research was obtained via Social Studies teachers that work in Secondary Schools in Hatay, Turkey, during 2019-2020 academic year. For this purpose, semi-structured interviews were performed with 15 Social Studies teachers. Descriptive analysis technique was used to analyze the data obtained as a result of semi-structured interviews. The data obtained from the research was evaluated; the findings were defined and interpreted. Accordingly, it was concluded that citizenship issues have a unifying and integrating structure, both individually and socially, in identity formation and realizing citizenship awareness, and also influence the adoption of social rules and transforming them into behavior.

Key words: Social Studies, Identity, Identity Formation, Teacher Views, Citizenship Awareness

INTRODUCTION

The concept of literacy is the ability to convey thoughts and feelings to others in written or verbal form, to perceive correctly what the other person says and write, and to use the acquired information effectively (Güneş, 2000). Today, literacy includes not only a phenomenon, but also phenomena in general terms. Therefore, it takes different meanings when it comes before different names (Altun, 2005). This concept, as an important concept in the education policy of the society, is considered as an important acquisition that can guide education today (Asıcı, 2009; Önal, 2010). In the context of social studies, citizenship issues are discussed within the dimension of social studies literacy, regarding identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant children. Therefore, the views of Social Studies teachers were asked on citizenship subjects in the context of social studies literacy, regarding the identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant children. Considering national issues the aim of Social Studies subject is to educate people in order to make them aware of their rights and responsibilities, perceive the concept of citizenship completely and realize their

identity formation. At the international level, it aims to raise people who have completed the formation identity of their country and have democratic values and beliefs. In other words, while it builds identity by informing children about the nation's history, achievements and requests, on the other hand, it prepares them for the future by teaching them their rights and responsibilities. Today, Social Studies subject assumes the responsibility in order to prepare children for the future regarding identity formation and develop citizenship awareness. Social studies is a field of study in which all social science branches are combined to improve people's citizenship competences (NCSS, 2009). It can be seen that this course has an important function in the formation and development of the social personality of the child. "Social Studies is a course in which the information obtained from social disciplines is selected and kneaded with an interdisciplinary approach and adapted to the perception level of the child at the Primary School level." (Sözer, 1998, p. 12). "Social Studies teachers should have general culture, field knowledge, teaching professional skills and qualifications in order to develop the desired behavior and sense of responsibility in students." (Erden, 1999, pp. 43-44). In order

to develop citizenship awareness, citizenship education is given at every grade level in many countries within the scope of Social Studies subject. For the development of citizenship awareness, subjects related to citizenship were gradually interspersed in the learning areas of Social Studies subject (Quigley, 2000). For the development of citizenship awareness, it is important that studies start at an early age, continue throughout school life, and take place in a scheduled program. Because, when Primary School students do not completely acquire basic citizenship, knowledge and skill values, further education steps are not enough for them to be trained as effective citizens (NCSS, 2009). Social Studies is a Primary education subject shaped in line with the principle of collective teaching for the identity formation of people (Ministry of National Education, 2005).

"Identity is the process of interpreting one's own belonging and acceptability in the world, relations with other people, and own existence within the framework of these relations." (Jenkins, 2008, p. 28). "It is a structure that determines political, religious, family, professional and social connections." (Köseoğlu, 1995, p. 43). "Identity is individual's self-identification and positioning. It is indicating which world of values the individual belongs to." (Kayan, 2007, p. 9). From past to present, it is seen that people are in constant change and socialization for the development of individual, social or cultural identity. Therefore, identity formation takes place and continues constantly by renewing itself. What people have learned in the past is traditionally accepted as the transfer of knowledge towards citizenship and identity formation. The past information of the society in which people live and some features that are loaded on this information are transferred to the person, and in this way the formation or development of an identity is supported (Demircioğlu, 2007). Identity is a dynamic phenomenon that is constantly built in every period of life. However, as formation continues, especially youth period, when consciousness is much more active and socialization process accelerates, has a significant influence. Not only can people develop their identity in their life, they can also re-create or change their identity as a result of an important event that they may experience in the following years (Kaya, 2007). Immigration, which is a social phenomenon based on social change and means that people leave the usual and past behind for new beginnings, leads to new identity formations and citizenship awareness, which is multidimensional transformation (Yalçın, 2004). Immigrant means a person who leaves his or her place, location, friends, relatives, even water and land in order to improve his or her own life, and decides to fight for a better life. They not only move within the country; but also move in the world by crossing borders." (Erdogan, 2011). People leave the land where they were born and grew up and migrate to other places in pursuit of a better future (Chambers, 2014; Kümbetoğlu, 2003). An immigrant is a person who settles in another country to continue his or her life (Castles and Miller, 2008; Erdoğan, 2015; Faist, 2003). Immigrants not only change their place physically, but also cause the cultures to move from one place to another (Baran, 2011). In other words, they take their own lifestyles,

values, ideas, identities and cultures with them and reflect them to their new environment. They form a cultural bridge between where they came from and where they settled. Therefore, their previous experiences will be effective in shaping their new life (Faist, 2003; Goldring, 1996; Ilgin & Hacıhasanoğlu, 2006; Şimşek, 2014). Immigrants differ culturally and build new identities as their past and new experiences meet and interact. Because "living elsewhere is always finding yourself in a conversation where different identities are recognized, exchanged and mixed, but not destroyed." (Chambers, 2014, p. 36). Immigration, which causes social changes and transformations by affecting every aspect of social structure, causes the society that accepts immigration to interact with immigrants of different religions, languages and ethnicities and creates different identities and sense of belonging (Özbek, 2004; Tekin, 2012).

PURPOSE OF THE RESEARCH

The purpose of this research is to determine the views of teachers on citizenship subjects in the context of social studies literacy, regarding identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students. Besides many branches of social sciences that have influence on the development of this process, it is seen that the Social Studies subject, which is one of the sub-branches of social sciences, is also effective in all areas of life. Immigration has led to the emergence of different cultures, understandings of citizenship and identity. The integration process of immigrants into society can be achieved by adopting the environment they live in, regulating their relations with each other and living together by adopting a settled order. As a result of the coexistence of socialized people, the purpose of identity formation and creating citizenship awareness brought education to the fore. By means of a good education, developing identity formation and citizenship level and creating sense of belonging, protecting the values that people have, and increasing their knowledge, skills and abilities can be provided in the light of what they learned by learning their past. Education is the foundation of being a good citizen as well as establishing a sense of identity. Although this process primarily starts in the family, Primary and Secondary School education have great responsibilities. As a matter of fact, in Primary School education Social Studies subject has a very rich structure with its content and subject variety. In Turkey, Primary School education Social Studies curriculum was reconsidered in line with the constructivist approach in 2018 and textbooks were renewed (MEB, 2018). The aim of the new program is to educate the students as citizens who adopt, protect and develop the national, moral, humanitarian, spiritual and cultural values of the Turkish nation and who love their family, homeland and nation and always try to glorify them and also who know their duties and responsibilities towards the Republic of Turkey and act accordingly. Via this research, it was aimed to reveal the influence of citizenship subjects in social studies on the identity formation and citizenship awareness development of immigrant students in line with the views of Social Studies teachers. In addition, teacher practices in teaching citizenship subjects are also

included regarding the development of identity formation and citizenship awareness. Thus, it was aimed to enable immigrant students to comprehend the acquisitions in social life and to transform these acquisitions into attitudes and behaviors, and to determine their educational needs. For this purpose, the research question was determined as "What are the views of teachers on identity formation and citizenship awareness in the context of social studies literacy?

The study also aims to explore the following questions below:

- 1. How is the Immigrant Students' State regarding Identity Formation and Citizenship Awareness?
- What is the Relationship between Teaching Citizenship Subjects and Identity Formation and Citizenship Awareness?
- 3. How do you evaluate the acquisitions of immigrant students regarding identity formation and citizenship awareness while studying citizenship subjects?
- 4. What are the characteristics of a person whose identity formation has been completed and who has acquired citizenship awareness?

IMPORTANCE OF RESEARCH

Each stage of education has a complementary function for each other in the development of people's self-consciousness, in the establishment of their citizenship awareness, and in training future generations in a responsible and conscious manner. In addition to the internalization of socialization and acculturation that takes place at every stage of life, education aims to instill the awareness of identity and citizenship and to educate students as citizens sensitive to the problems of the age. Although citizenship education is at every stage of education, citizenship awareness is considered as a reflection or functioning of life. With the awareness of citizenship, students comprehend their future responsibilities and roles as well as being a good citizen in general (Kerr, 1999). In the international literature and education programs, the development of citizenship awareness is expressed as the education given in order to respect the human rights of the students and to act with the awareness of protecting and benefiting these rights, when considered within the scope of formal education (Tezgel, 2008). Education must undertake the creation of a new social order that will realize the core values of culture and which is in harmony with the social and economic forces underlying the contemporary world at the same time. In other words, society must be created by the people themselves in a democratic framework with its main institutions and resources. Thus, an ideal society and an ideal democracy can be acquired (Arslan, 1999). While people shape their future, they act with the values of the past and acquire some behaviors and understandings. These behaviors and understandings determine the identity and citizenship awareness of the person. A person who has acquired the awareness of identity formation and citizenship does not remain indifferent to the events and problems around; on the contrary questions the problems and tries to evaluate the causes and consequences in the light of the past. People express themselves via the identities they have. From past to present, people have

been asked questions about identity information, constantly questioning who they are, where they come from and where they are going to (Kaya, 2007). Every person has acted in accordance with the identity structure of the society and lived in a certain sense of belonging. People who have this sense of belonging have contributed to the formation of citizenship awareness by living together. Increasing the awareness of citizenship has been considered as a need for every society and it has always been very important for a democratic society to raise talented, foresighted, conscious, patriotic people who can deal with the problems that arise in the developing world considering time and place. It is thought that this research, which was conducted in the context of social studies literacy, will make an important contribution to the field in terms of identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students.

METHOD

In the context of social studies literacy, case study design, which is one of the qualitative research methods, was used in order to determine the views of teachers on citizenship subjects regarding identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students. Qualitative research methods are preferred research methods in terms of benefiting from the experiences of the people who participate in the research and understanding their feelings and thoughts (Ekiz, 2003). On the other hand case study design is one of the qualitative research designs that aim to deal with a single person, a school, a group, an environment or a phenomenon, in short, the situation to be studied in real life (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018). There is an in-depth analysis of the subject discussed in the case study. For this purpose, a semi-structured teacher interview form was used to collect the research data. The semi-structured interview form provides a more detailed examination of the researched subject together with the fixed alternative respond (Creswell, 2012).

Population and Sample

Population, which constitutes the framework of the research, is expressed in two ways; the target population and the accessible population (Neuman, 2014). The target population is almost impossible to reach and it is the ideal choice of the researcher. The accessible population is the realistic choice of the researcher and it is accessible. In the context of social studies literacy, maximum diversity sampling was used for determining the sample in order to determine the views of teachers on citizenship subjects regarding identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students. The main purpose of maximum diversity sampling is to create a small sample and to reflect the diversity of individuals who may be a party to the problem studied in this sample at the maximum level. The aim is not to provide diversity in order to generalize; on the contrary, it is aimed to find out whether there are common or shared phenomena and differences among situations indicating diversity and to reveal different dimensions of the problem according to diversity (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018). Since school is an important variable in the process of transferring citizenship subjects to students, socio-economic status of schools was taken into account in the evaluation of identity formation and citizenship awareness. Accordingly, the maximum diversity sampling was conducted considering the socio-economic structures of the schools. Secondary schools were determined considering their lower, middle and upper socio-economic status, and depending on the maximum diversity sampling 15 Social Studies teachers voluntarily agreed to be interviewed, and a small sample was formed.

Gathering Data

Qualitative studies usually collect three types of data; data about the environment, data about the process and data about perceptions (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018). In this research, it was preferred to gather "data on perceptions". Accordingly, interview technique was used with the teachers in the study group in order to determine their views on citizenship subjects in the Social Studies course on identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students. Interview is a (investigation) technique which is used to gather data via verbal communication. In addition to being one of the data gathering tools in qualitative research, it is also one of the very powerful methods used to understand people (Karasar, 2018). In this technique, the researcher predetermines the questions to be addressed to the interviewer. However, the researcher can make changes during the interview with extra or sub-questions depending on the state of the interview. For example, the researcher might not ask questions that have already been answered, or might ask in-depth questions for detailed information. Semi-structured interview technique is one of the techniques frequently used in educational researches since it has both a certain level of standardization and flexibility (Patton, 2014). Maximum variation sampling was used to determine the sample. The main purpose of maximum variation sampling is to form a small sample and to reflect the variety of individuals at the maximum level, who may be a side to the case studied in this sample. The purpose is not to provide variety in order to generalize. On the contrary, the purpose is to try to find out whether there are common and shared facts or differences among situations that indicate variety and to reveal different dimensions of the case according to variety (Yıldırım & Simsek, 2018). Since school is an important variable in the process of conveying citizenship subject to students, socio-economic status of schools was taken into account in the evaluation of identity formation and citizenship awareness. Accordingly, maximum variation sampling was conducted according to the socio-economic structures of schools. The list of Secondary Schools in the central districts was obtained from Hatay Provincial Directorate of National Education, and these schools were determined according to their lower, middle and upper socio-economic status, and teachers who voluntarily agreed to be interviewed according to maximum variation sampling were accessed. Fifteen volunteer teachers participated in the research and a small sample was formed. Information about the teachers, who participated in the research, regarding gender, code name, graduation status, time

of professional service, and the grade they teach is indicated in Table 1

33% of the teachers who participated in the pre-application of the research were female and 77% were male. Considering the distribution of teachers according to their professional service time, 20% of teachers had 1-4 years, 20% had 5-9 years, 20.1% had 10-14 years, 26.6% had 15-19 years, and 13.3 of them had 20 years and more experience. Again, 60% of teachers graduated from the Faculty of Education and 40% of them graduated from the Faculty of Sciences and Letters. 80% of the teachers had undergraduate study and 20% of them had master's degree. In addition, 26.6% of the teachers taught 5th and 6th grades; 33.3% of them taught 6th and 7th grades, and 40% of them taught 5th, 6th and 7th grades.

Interviews with Social Studies teachers were conducted in the local language, which is Turkish. In pre-interview briefing, the participants were told that they could quit the interview any time they want. In addition, the interviews were recorded with a voice recorder. Participants were asked to fill up a consent form in order to take permission for recording. Information regarding the date, place and duration of the interviews are indicated in Table 2.

In order to obtain the qualitative data of the research, the interviews with 15 Social Studies teachers were made between 20.02.2020 and 24.03.2020 and counselor's room was used as the interview place. Interviews with teachers took 20-35 minutes.

Semi-structured Teacher Interview Form

Exploring the views of teachers about citizenship subjects in the context of social studies literacy regarding the identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students, the opinions and suggestions of the field experts were utilized in the preparation of the semi-structured teacher interview form considering classroom education practices. In accordance with the main themes of the research, 7 interview questions were prepared and presented to teachers and experts. As a result of the reviews, the questions that had similar content and considered out of purpose were eliminated. As a result of this study, 4 interview questions that were found appropriate to be included in the interview form were prepared within the framework of the main themes determined and a semi-structured teacher interview form, which is one of the qualitative data gathering techniques, was completed. This form consists of questions that aim to determine the characteristics of people who acquire identity formation and citizenship awareness. There were four questions about the research subject in the interview, and each question was also the sub-questions of the research. After the interview form was prepared, an internal validity study was conducted. "In qualitative researches internal validity is about whether the researcher can measure the data which wants to be measured with the tool or method used." (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018). In order to provide the internal validity of the interview form, the interview form was presented to 5 academicians who were experts in the field. As a result of the feedback given by these 5 academicians, the pilot interviews

Table 1. Demographic characteristics of the teachers who participated in the interview

| No | Code Name | District | Gender | Faculty Graduated | Education | Classroom Taught | Professional Experience |
|----|-----------|----------|--------|-------------------|-----------------|------------------|----------------------------|
| 1 | T 1 | Hatay | M | Education | Undergraduate | 5-6 | 1-4 years |
| 2 | T 2 | Hatay | F | Sci-Letters | Undergraduate | 5-6 | 5-9 years |
| 3 | Т3 | Hatay | F | Education | Master's Degree | 5-6-7 | 15-19 years |
| 4 | T 4 | Hatay | F | Sci-Letters | Undergraduate | 6-7 | 10-14 years |
| 5 | T 5 | Hatay | M | Sci-Letters | Undergraduate | 5-6 | 20 years and more |
| 6 | T 6 | Hatay | M | Education | Undergraduate | 5-6 | 1-4 years |
| 7 | Т7 | Hatay | M | Education | Undergraduate | 6-7 | 20 years and more |
| 8 | T 8 | Hatay | M | Education | Undergraduate | 6-7 | 10-14 years |
| 9 | T 9 | Hatay | F | Education | Undergraduate | 5-6-7 | 5-9 years |
| 10 | T10 | Hatay | F | Sci-Letters | Undergraduate | 6-7 | 1-4 years |
| 11 | T 11 | Hatay | M | Sci-Letters | Master's Degree | 5-6-7 | 5-9 years |
| 12 | T 12 | Hatay | M | Education | Undergraduate | 5-6-7 | 10-14 years |
| 13 | T 13 | Hatay | M | Education | Undergraduate | 6-7 | 10-14 years |
| 14 | T 14 | Hatay | M | Sci-Letters | Master's Degree | 5-6 -7 | 15-19 years |
| 15 | T 15 | Hatay | F | Education | Undergraduate | 5-6 - 7 | 15- 19 years |

Table 2. Data of interviews made with teachers

| Interview No | Name | Interview Date/Hour | Interview Duration | Interview Place |
|--------------|------|---------------------|--------------------|------------------|
| 1 | T 1 | 20.02.2020/09.30 | 30 | Counselor's Room |
| 2 | T 2 | 21.02.2020/13.45 | 20 | Counselor's Room |
| 3 | T 3 | 03.03.2020/09.00 | 30 | Counselor's Room |
| 4 | T 4 | 03.03.2020/15.30 | 35 | Counselor's Room |
| 5 | T 5 | 04.03.2020/10.25 | 25 | Counselor's Room |
| 6 | T 6 | 04.03.2020/16.30 | 30 | Counselor's Room |
| 7 | Т7 | 10.03.2020/09.30 | 30 | Counselor's Room |
| 8 | T 8 | 10.03.2020/13.15 | 25 | Counselor's Room |
| 9 | Т9 | 11.03.2020/10.00 | 30 | Counselor's Room |
| 10 | T 10 | 11.03.2020/15.45 | 30 | Counselor's Room |
| 11 | T 11 | 17.03.2020/09.30 | 25 | Counselor's Room |
| 12 | T 12 | 17.03.2020/17.00 | 20 | Counselor's Room |
| 13 | T 13 | 18.03.2020/10.30 | 30 | Counselor's Room |
| 14 | T 14 | 18.03.2020/15.30 | 30 | Counselor's Room |
| 15 | T 15 | 24.03.2020/12.20 | 25 | Counselor's Room |

and the analysis of the transcripts, it was concluded that the interview questions could measure the data to be measured, and the validity of the interview questions was accepted.

Analysis and Interpretation of Data

"There are two data analysis processes in qualitative researches; descriptive analysis and content analysis." (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018, p. 223). The data obtained as a result of the interviews made with the teachers was analyzed using the descriptive analysis method in the research. According to Yıldırım and Şimşek (2018), descriptive analysis consists of four stages. These are; creating a framework for descriptive analysis, processing data according to the thematic framework, transcription of interviews and reliability of research

data. The data obtained from the interviews made with the teachers were coded and a code list was formed. A coding percentage was formed by comparing the similarities and differences in coding numerically (Çelik, 2009). After the interview coding key was read separately by the researchers, the codes with "agreement" and "disagreement" was determined (Ünlüer, 2008) and reliability analysis was started. The reliability formula suggested by Miles and Huberman (1994) was used to calculate the reliability of the study. It is stated that if the result calculated with the reliability formula is at the level of 70% (Gay, 1987; Miles & Huberman, 2015), the reliability of the research will be provided. The data was analyzed from different perspectives. Afterwards, the reliability of the study was calculated with the formula of Miles and Huberman (2015) "Agreement/(Agreement +

Disagreement) x 100" (Çetin, 2016) and the reliability coefficient was found 88%. This result indicated that the research was reliable. Then, the interpretation of the findings was started. At this stage, "the researcher has to give meaning to the data gathered in this last stage and explain the relationships between findings, establish cause-effect relationships, draw some conclusions from the findings, and make explanations about the importance of the results obtained." (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018, p. 238). In line with the interview coding key, with the help of the findings obtained, determining the views of the teachers, the frequency of similar views were evaluated in general, and the views of the teachers on citizenship subjects in the context of social studies literacy regarding the identity formation of immigrant students and acquiring citizenship awareness were interpreted.

Research Ethics

Rules of research and publication ethics were followed in this study. Therefore, citations were made in accordance with scientific criteria and the sources utilized were expressed in accordance with the rules both in the text and in the bibliography section. In addition, the names of the interviewed teachers were kept confidential in the study, and coded as T 1, T 2, T 3, and they were asked to fill volunteer consent form

RESULTS

Semi-structured interviews were conducted with Social Studies teachers. During the interviews, various questions were asked about the identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students, and the interview findings were coded in line with the answers received. Coding was gathered and evaluated under some themes.

Findings Regarding Identity Formation and Citizenship Awareness of Immigrant Students

The answers of Social Studies teachers about identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students and frequency distributions are given in Table 3.

As it is seen in Table 3, answers given by Social Studies teachers about identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students were gathered under the unique theme of individual's self-knowledge in all aspects, and the number of the reported views was 30. Teachers expressed different views regarding this theme as it is seen in Table 3. It is seen that the most repeated view is related to "National values". In relation to this, participants generally emphasized the importance of these values. T12 stated that "The formation of national values depends on the existence of the nation, its continuity, and therefore the existence of the country. It is possible for immigrants to continue their lives in unity, solidarity and social solidarity with the formation of identity, which is at the forefront of national values". T13 stated that, "Whether people living in the same society have a national value or not depends on whether these people are connected to a common past and culture." T11 stated that "While

Table 3. Views and frequency distributions of Social Studies teachers about immigrant students' identity formation and citizenship awareness

| Views | f |
|---|----|
| Self-knowledge of the individual in all aspects | |
| National values | 6 |
| Rights and responsibilities | 5 |
| Historical knowledge | 4 |
| Ethnic structure and culture | 4 |
| Love respect and tolerance | 3 |
| State or social culture | 3 |
| Knowledge ability and solidarity | 2 |
| Sense of self | 2 |
| Religious beliefs | 1 |
| Total | 30 |

the nations that consciously live and transfer their national values to future generations continue their existence, it is not possible to talk about the identity development process of communities that cannot protect their national and spiritual values." The least repeated view under the same theme was discussed under the title of "Religious beliefs". I teacher gave an opinion regarding this issue. T11 stated that, "Religion, which has a very wide function both individually and socially, has a balancing role in determining the shape and direction of the harmony and behaviors of individuals in their inner worlds. With this feature, it adds meaning to the lives of immigrant students and is effective in gaining identity and citizenship awareness."

When the answers given by Social Studies teachers about identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students are examined, it can be stated that they define identity formation as being individuals with national and spiritual values, who are dependent on the existence of the country and nation, who know their national values, who live and transfer them to future generations. Citizenship awareness, on the other hand, is defined as the effort to live and maintain traditions and cultures, being aware of fundamental rights and responsibilities, knowing and protecting rights, fulfilling responsibilities, respecting the rights of others with freedom of religion, conscience and thought while keeping people together. Teachers also stated the opinion of being a model for their environment with their exemplary behaviors.

The Relationship between Teaching Citizenship Subjects and Identity Formation with Citizenship Awareness of Immigrant Students

The answers and frequency distributions of Social Studies teachers about the relationship between teaching citizenship subjects, identity formation and citizenship awareness are given in Table 4.

As it is seen in Table 4, teachers expressed their views about the relationship between the teaching of citizenship subjects and the identity formation of immigrant students and citizenship awareness under two themes and expressed

Table 4. Teachers' views and frequency distributions regarding the relationship between teaching citizenship subjects and identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students

| Views | f |
|--|----|
| With citizenship education, immigrant students acquire identity and citizenship awareness. | |
| It is a process in which they acquire a sense of self. | 7 |
| It is a process that begins with birth. | 4 |
| It is a process that creates traditions and cultural texture. | 4 |
| It is a process in which they position themselves against others. | 4 |
| It is a social and psychological process established with other people. | 3 |
| It is the process of emotions and meaning attributed to the place they live. | 2 |
| Immigrant students develop themselves in a positive way with the responsibilities they acquire | |
| They know and try to understand both themselves and the society. | 7 |
| Helps immigrant students to position themselves in society. | 5 |
| Raises the awareness of immigrant students about the problems in the world. | 4 |
| Helps immigrant students recognize the structure of the place where they live. | 4 |
| Teaches the responsibilities of immigrant students in society. | 2 |
| Total | 46 |

different issues. Accordingly, it is seen that 46 views were expressed in total. Social Studies teachers expressed different issues under two themes as it is seen in Table 4. The first theme is "citizenship education gives immigrant students identity awareness" and 24 views were reported under this theme. In this context, the most repeated view was about "It is a process in which they acquire a sense of self", and the teachers expressed their views on these items 7 times. Accordingly, T 6 stated that "Citizenship course helps immigrant children to become self-confident individuals by providing information about their lives." T7 stated that, "With a good citizenship education, immigrant children organize their relations and connections with the society; they also comprehend themselves and take the steps to be taken with this awareness." The least repeated view under the first theme was "It is the process of meaning and emotions attributed to the place they live." T1 stated that, "The place where immigrant students live and the conditions that affect this place must be known well in order to express the development of the society accurately since its beginning and its change in the process."

Teachers expressed totally 22 views regarding the second theme, "Immigrant students develop themselves positively with the responsibilities they have acquired". In this context, it is seen that the most repeated view was "They know and try to understand both themselves and the society".

Accordingly, T 15 stated that "as people are shaped in their social environment with the development of identity starting from birth, firstly they recognize the perceptions of the society they live in (religion, language, culture, etc.) and thus make sense of themselves."

It is seen that the least repeated view was "it teaches immigrant students their responsibilities in society". T 11 stated that, "The most important relationship between the teaching of citizenship subjects and the development of citizenship awareness is that teaching these subjects teaches immigrant students their responsibilities."

When the answers given by Social Studies teachers about the relationship between teaching citizenship subjects and identity formation were examined, it can be suggested that citizenship education regulates the relations and connections of immigrant students with their environment, enabling them to be self-confident individuals who perceive and interpret the facts correctly. Immigrant students, who develop citizenship inquiry skills through citizenship education, grow up as individuals questioning how and why. Immigrant children, who grow up in line with this basic principle, become respectful individuals who are loyal to nature, environment, country and nation. In other words, it helps immigrant students become individuals with an increasing social awareness. It regulates relationships with other people. It helps them to know how they perceive themselves, at what point they position themselves in society and to know themselves better. It also helps them to be more sensitive towards social problems in society and to develop a sense of responsibility towards other people.

Views Regarding the Question How Do You Evaluate Students' Acquisitions Regarding Identity Formation and Citizenship Awareness While Discussing Citizenship Subjects?

The answers of Social Studies teachers and frequency distributions regarding the evaluation of citizenship subjects' acquisitions of students regarding identity formation and citizenship awareness are given in Table 5.

As it is seen in Table 5, the answers given by Social Studies teachers regarding the evaluation of citizenship subjects regarding identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students were discussed in terms of theme of assessment, and 68 views were reported. It is seen that the most repeated view regarding this was "Written exams". T 15 stated that "Despite I use many measurement tools to determine the post-teaching status of the student; I mostly give importance to written exams." T1 stated that, "While evaluating the student's acquisitions, I try to measure student success by asking true-false questions, open-ended questions, and short-answered questions in addition to written exams." In Table 5, it is seen that the least repeated view under a single theme is "Product file". Regarding this T 4 stated that "Just like every teacher, I utilize similar measurement techniques. I also want students to create a product file about the assignments I have given to them. At the end of the year, I evaluate students separately by looking at the scores assignments through this product file."

Table 5. Teachers' views and frequency distributions regarding how the acquisitions related to identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students are evaluated

| Views | \overline{f} |
|------------------------------|----------------|
| In terms of assessment forms | |
| Written exams | 15 |
| True false questions | 6 |
| Open-ended questions | 6 |
| Short answer questions | 6 |
| Match questions | 4 |
| Concept maps | 4 |
| Activity studies | 4 |
| Project work | 4 |
| Question-answer | 4 |
| Oral exams | 3 |
| Observation | 3 |
| Multiple choice tests | 3 |
| Homework evaluation form | 3 |
| Product file | 3 |
| Total | 68 |

When the answers given by the Social Studies teachers regarding the evaluation of the acquisitions of immigrant students regarding identity formation and the development of citizenship awareness are examined it was found that the most utilized measurement technique in evaluating the outcomes was written exams and that in terms of content the written exams consist of true false questions, open ended questions, short answer questions, match questions, and multiple-choice tests. In addition, teachers stated that other measurement and evaluation techniques such as activity studies, project studies, question answer, mutual matching, verbal exams, observation, homework evaluation form, and product file were also used at the least.

Characteristics of a Person Who Has Acquired Identity Formation and Citizenship Awareness

The answers of Social Studies teachers and frequency distributions regarding identity formation and the state of a person who has acquired citizenship awareness are given in Table 6.

As it is seen in Table 6, when the answers given by Social Studies teachers regarding the situation of a person whose identity formation was completed and who acquired citizenship awareness were examined, 57 views were expressed under three themes and different issues were mentioned. The first theme, in which totally 17 views were reported, was discussed in terms of personal rights, and it is seen that the most repeated view within this theme was "Must know his or her rights and be respectful to the rights of others". Accordingly, T 14 defined it as "a person who knows his or her citizenship rights and respects others". The least repeated view under the first theme in Table 6 was "Must be able to express their thoughts; must be able to criticize when appropriate and be

Table 6. Teachers' views and frequency distributions regarding the question "What are the characteristics of a person who has acquired identity formation and citizenship awareness?"

| Views | f | |
|--|----|--|
| In terms of personal rights | | |
| Must know their rights and respect the rights of others | 7 | |
| Must be able to express their opinions and be tolerant of different ideas. | 5 | |
| Must be able to criticize and be open to criticism when appropriate | 5 | |
| In terms of behavior | | |
| Must be self-aware and obey the law | 6 | |
| Must be a role model | 6 | |
| Be sensitive to the problems around and do what is necessary | 6 | |
| Must try to do the best | 4 | |
| Must be useful and productive to the environment. | 4 | |
| Must be able to communicate well with the environment and be assertive | 4 | |
| Must know and fulfill their responsibilities | 4 | |
| In terms of national values | | |
| Must love and try to protect their homeland and nation | 3 | |
| Must be familiar with the world and follow developments | 3 | |
| Total | 57 | |

open to criticism". Regarding this issue T 7 stated that "As teachers, we must listen to our students, care about their opinions and value them. Students who are raised in this way express their own thoughts, and they become respectful and tolerant of others' opinions at the same time.

In Table 6, the second theme was discussed in terms of behavior and the most repeated view was "Must know himself/herself; Must obey the law, be a role model for the environment; Must be sensitive to the problems around and do what is necessary". Regarding this issue, T 3 stated that "Students realize citizenship awareness through learning over time. As a result of learning, they know themselves and act in accordance with the law." On the other hand T10 stated that, "It is a person who does not go against the law and who is a role model to environment with his or her behaviors." According to the least repeated view, "Must try to do his or her job in the best way; must be useful and productive to the environment, must communicate well and be sociable; Must know and fulfill his or her responsibilities". In addition T4 stated that, "The person who has acquired identity formation and citizenship awareness must show model behaviors, try to do his or her job in the best way, be useful and productive." T 3 stated that, "A person who is useful and productive for the environment, also loves and tries to protect his or her homeland and nation." Teacher Ali expressed his views on the issue as follows: T 7 stated that, "A person who acquires identity formation and citizenship awareness sets an example and guides people with his or her behaviors and

perspectives on events. Their communication power is high and their understanding of love and respect in dialogues with the environment is at the forefront."

In Table 6, the third theme is discussed in terms of national values and it is stated that "One must love and try to protect his or her homeland and nation; must know the world and follow the developments". Accordingly, T 6 stated that, "It is not possible for a person, who does not adopt the national and spiritual values in the society he or she lives, to have the love of the homeland." T2 stated that, "The citizenship and identity awareness of a person, who understands the importance of the flag and the National Anthem, which are among the citizenship issues, increases. In this context, the student, whose awareness of citizenship increases, tries to protect the values of the country by increasing the love of homeland and nation, and also follows and observes the developments in the world with the perspective on the countries of the world, and tries to be a part of the solution".

When the answers given by Social Studies teachers regarding the characteristics of a person whose identity formation and citizenship awareness develop by learning citizenship issues are examined; they stated that "Must know their rights and act with a sense of responsibility and respect others' opinions, sensitive to the problems around them, open to criticism, love their homeland and nation, follow world developments and try to be a part of the solution, and act as a role model towards their environment."

DISCUSSION

Social studies literacy appears as an important discipline in terms of preparing people for life, being an active citizen and concerning the acquisition of literacy in several fields. Social studies literacy is valuable for easy living in various fields of social sciences. It has a very important place especially in the identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students. Because; "Identities are never complete, they are always subjectively in process of formation" (Pamuk, 2014, p. 89). According to Pamuk (2014, p. 90): "When the individuals feel the need of belonging in different contexts, they get closer to the collective identity which is closest to them and fulfill this need. When they consider themselves as valuable, they move away from this collective identity and create their own narrative." Turkish schools are multicultural so, for immigrants they are the basic environment for the experience of living together. With this feature, schools prepare students for social life by contributing to common life. According to the results of the research, citizenship subjects make important contributions to the identity formation and citizenship awareness development of immigrant students. Social studies literacy in general and citizenship in particular aim to provide information to empower immigrant students as future citizens of a democratic Turkish society, as well as to prepare them for social life by giving them the ability to make decisions. The subjects of history, geography and citizenship that make up social studies literacy provide field-specific multidisciplinary contributions in harmony with each other in understanding social reality and in the development of competencies necessary for life

and participation in a democratic society. Education has an important role in shaping the worldview of children who start to receive education at a young age. Many attributions such as "Turkish citizen" "Turkish student" etc. make individuals feel belong to the geography and nation they live in. Strengthening individuals' feeling of belonging to homeland and nation, they create alternative identities for group identities. The issue of which identity will be more prominent for the individual among multiple identities is an important matter. In this context, the person who acquires identity formation and citizenship awareness has national values, knows legal rights and duties, has a historical background, ethnic structure and social culture, loves, respects and tolerates, has a sense of self and acts in a sense of solidarity. With the developing technology, our world now resembles a "digital village". Accordingly, people are in constant communication with different cultures. This situation reveals universal values that are accepted all over the world. Citizenship subject is of great importance within the scope of social studies literacy in teaching these universal values. In today's world of commitment and dependence, citizenship education means raising people who behave with a sense of devotion to the whole world and to the whole humanity, as well as to the country, without losing their identity and self, in order to overcome global problems, by tolerating and accepting differences between cultures, and being aware of intercultural interaction and aware of the fact that their small efforts can achieve enormous results with a sense of responsibility in a global spectrum (Çolak, 2015). As a result, it was concluded that citizenship subjects have a unifying and integrating structure, in the development (formation) of identity and the settlement of citizenship (awareness) both individually and socially, and that it is very effective in adopting social rules and transforming them into behavior.

In this part, the results obtained depending on the findings obtained as a result of the analysis of the research data were discussed and evaluated.

Results of Identity Formation and Citizenship Awareness of Immigrant Students

When the answers given by the Social Studies teachers about the identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students were examined, it was seen that; teachers defined the immigrant students as individuals who are loyal to the country and aware of their fundamental rights responsibilities, knowing national values and striving to live and maintain their traditions and cultures. Based on this, it was concluded that immigrant students are living comfortably with the local people they interact with in socio-cultural and economic terms, so they build their identities and have good citizenship awareness. In Arslan's study (2014), in which the views of teachers and students regarding citizenship education in multicultural societies, it was seen that the citizenship education given in schools is very important in terms of realizing the target behaviors in the classes where students from different cultures are educated. From this point of view, the findings of both studies indicate overlapping qualities.

Results of the Relationship between Teaching Citizenship Subject and Identity Formation and Citizenship Awareness

Teachers stated 47 views on the relationship between teaching geography subjects, one of the interview questions, and identity formation and citizenship awareness. When the answers given to the interview question were examined, the most repeated titles regarding the effect of teachers' citizenship issues on identity formation and citizenship awareness were discussed as follows. 'Citizenship education helps people know their relationship with each other and with their surroundings. With citizenship education, people regulate their relations with society and in this way it enables them to perceive and interpret the facts correctly and become self-confident individuals. People who grow up in line with this basic principle are raised as respectful individuals who are loyal to their society, country and nation. In addition, citizenship issues help them become individuals with increased social awareness. It contributes to the development of personality structure along with the identity development process of people. It was concluded that it develops citizenship awareness according to the relations with other people, how s/he perceives himself, at what point s/he positions himself or herself in the society, and according to the perception and evaluation in the face of events occurring around.' When this finding of the research is evaluated, it is in line with the finding of Esen's (2011) study in which the subjects related to human rights and citizenship awareness in the Social Studies curriculum were determined according to the views of teachers.

Results of How Immigrant Students Evaluate the Acquisitions Related to Identity Formation and Citizenship Awareness While Performing Citizenship Subjects

Considering the views regarding the effect of citizenship subjects on the identity formation of immigrant students, it was seen that the teachers considered it as a social and psychological process that people establish with each other, forming the tradition, custom and cultural structure starting from their birth. In addition, teachers explained identity formation as a process in which people position themselves against others. With this explanation, it was concluded that immigrant students put countries and nations in the world at different points with their own country, compare cultural and economic similarities and differences, and teachers mostly measure with written exams. This finding seems to overlap with the findings of teachers' views on the use of written exams as a measurement tool in the language and expression course in the study of Türkyılmaz (2008). In addition, in the study of Meydan and Öztürk (2012), the views of classroom teachers on the assessment and evaluation approach applied in teaching Social Studies overlap with the finding.

Results of the Characteristics of a Person Who Acquired Identity Formation and Citizenship Awareness

In the research, it was concluded that the person, who acquires identity formation and citizenship awareness, is respectful and tolerant; has got a sense of self, national values, social culture and historical background; knows his or her legal rights and responsibilities, acts in a sense of solidarity, and can recognize and express himself or herself in terms of material and spiritual elements. In this context, when this finding of the research is evaluated in general, it is seen that it is in line with Davis, Gregory and Riley (1999) and Ersoy's (2007) research findings that suggest the person who knows and uses his or her rights and responsibilities, expresses thoughts easily, respects the rights of others, loves his or her country and nation, and who is interested and cooperative against the problems concerning people.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the interviews with Social Studies teachers, it can be stated that they made some recommendations for the citizenship subjects to increase the identity formation and citizenship awareness of immigrant students in the context of social studies literacy. While dealing with citizenship is discussed in the classroom, subjects must be shared and evaluated in the classroom environment by making associations with current and social events. While preparing education programs for the teaching of citizenship subjects that raise identity formation and citizenship awareness, immigrants must be taken into consideration. A case study can be conducted regarding the reflection of social identity formation's effect on individual identity formation on immigrant students.

REFERENCES

Altun, A. (2005). Gelişen teknolojiler ve yeni okuryazarlıklar. Anı Yayıncılık.

Arslan, A. (1999). Felsefeye giriş. Vadi Yayınları.

Arslan, S. (2014). Çokkültürlü toplumlarda vatandaşlık Eğitimine yönelik öğretmen ve öğrenci düşüncelerinin incelenmesi (Yayımlanmamış doktora tezi). Marmara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimler Enstitüsü, İstanbul.

Aşıcı, M. (2009). Kişisel ve sosyal bir değer olarak okuryazarlık. *Değerler Eğitimi Dergisi*, 7(17), 9-26.

Baran A. (2011). 9.sınıf coğrafya ders kitabı. (Lider Yayınevi.). http://www. cografyabilgisi.com/adlı web adresinden, 13.06.2021 tarihinde alınmıştır.

Castels, S., & Miller, M. J. (2008). *Göçler çağı: Modern dünyada uluslararası göç hareketleri* (1. baskı). (B. U. Bal, & İ. Akbulut, Çev.). Kurtiş Matbaacılık.

Chambers, I. (2014). *Göç, kültür, kimlik* (2. Baskı). (I. Türkmen & M. Beşikçi, Çev.). Ayrıntı Yayınları.

Creswell, J. W. (2012). Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research (Fourth edition b.). Pearson Education, Inc.

Çelik, H. (2009). Sosyal bilgiler öğretmenlerinin vatandaşlık Eğitiminin bugünkü durumu ve geleceğine il-

işkin görüşleri (Doktora Tezi). YÖK Tez Merkezi. (257211)

- Çetin, A. (2016). An analysis metaphors used by high school students to describe physics, physics lesson and physics teacher. *European J. of Physics Education*, 7(2).
- Çolak, K. (2015). Sosyal bilgiler ile vatandaşlık ve demokrasi Eğitimi derslerinde küresel vatandaşlık Eğitimi. (Yayımlanmamış doktora tezi). Marmara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimler Enstitüsü, İstanbul.
- Davies, I., Gregory, I., & Riley. S. C. (1999). *Good citizen ship and educational provision*. Routledge Falmer.
- Demircioğlu, İ.H. (2007). *Tarih öğretiminde öğrenci merke*zli yaklaşımlar. Anı Yayınevi.
- Ekiz, D. (2009). *Bilimsel araştırma yöntemleri*. Anı Yayınlar. Erden, M. (1999), *Öğretmenlik mesleğine giriş*. Alkım Yayınevi.
- Erdoğan, M. M. (2011). Göçmenlikten yurttaşlığa geçiş. *Almanya ve göç. 50. Yılında Almanya'da Türkler Sempozyumu* (71-82). https://www.ytb.gov.tr/ytbadmin/assets/uploads/files/almanya-ve-goc.pdf
- Erdoğan, M. M. (2015). *Türkiye'deki Suriyeliler: Toplumsal kabul ve uyum.* İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- Ersoy, A. F. (2007). Sosyal bilgiler dersinde öğretmenlerin etkili vatandaşlık Eğitimi uygulamalarına ilişkin görüşleri (Doktora Tezi). YÖK Tez Merkezi. (257211).
- Esen, H. (2011). Sosyal-duygusal öğrenme programlarının sosyal duygusal öğrenme becerilerinin gelişimine, akademik başarı ve sınıf iklimi algısına etkisi (Yüksek Lisans tezi). Yükseköğretim Kurulu Ulusal Tez Merkezi'nden Edinilmiştir.(Tez No.308955).
- Faist, T. (2003). *Uluslararası göç ve ulusaşırı toplumsal alanlar* (A. Z. Gündoğan ve C. Nacar, Çev.). Bağlam Yayınları.
- Gay, L. R. (1987). Educational research competencies for analysis and application. (Third ed.). Merrill Publishing Company.
- Güneş, F. (2000). Okuma-yazma öğretimi ve beyin teknolojisi. Ocak Yayınları.
- Ilgın, C., & Hacıhasanoğlu, O. (2006). Göç- aidiyet ilişkisinin belirlenmesi için model: Berlin/Kreuzberg örneği. *İTÜ Dergisi/a, Mimarlık, Planlama, Tasarım, 5*(2), 59-70.
- Jenkins, R. (2008). Social identity. Routledge.
- Karasar, N. (2018), *Bilimsel araştırma yöntemi*. Nobel Yayınevi.
- Kaya, Y. (2007). Kimlikler yeniden dağıtılırken: Millî kimlikler. Kürenin halleri. Doğu Kütüphanesi Yayınları.
- Kayan, R. (2007), *Vahyin gölgesinde kimlik inşası*.Çıra Yayınları.
- Kerr, D. (1999). Citizen ship education: An international comparison. An international review of curriculum and assessment frame works. QCA.
- Köseoğlu, N. (1995). Kültür/kimlik üzerine. *Türkiye Günlüğü İki Aylık Fikir ve Kültür Dergisi*, 33(1), 41-47.
- Kümbetoğlu, F. B. (2003). Küresel gidişat, değişen göçmenler ve göçmenlik. A. Kaya, & G. G. Özdoğan içinde,

- Uluslararası İlişkilerde Sınır Tanımayan Sorunlar (pp. 271-298). Bağlam Yayınları.
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (2015). Nitel veri analizi (S. Akbaba- Altun, & A. Ersoy, Çev. Ed.). Pegem Akademi.
- Millî Eğitim Bakanlığı. (2005). İlköğretim sosyal bilgiler dersi (4, 5, 6, 7. sınıflar) öğretim programı. MEB Yayınevi.
- Millî Eğitim Bakanlığı. (2018). Sosyal bilgiler dersi öğretim programı (ilkokul ve ortaokul 4, 5, 6 ve 7.sınıf) Erişim adresi: http://mufredat.meb.gov.tr/ProgramDetay.aspx-?PID=354
- NCSS. (2009). Creating effective citizens. National council for the social studies. http://www.socialstudies.org/positions/effectivecitizens web adresinden, 24.06.2020 tarihinde alınmıştır.
- Neuman, W. L. (2014). Social research methods: Qualitative and quantitative approaches (7. Edition). Pearson.
- Önal, İ. (2010). Tarihsel Değişim Sürecinde Yaşam Boyu Öğrenme ve Okuryazarlık: Türkiye Deneyimi. *Bilgi Dünyası*, *11*(1), 101-121.
- Özbek, C. (2004). Vatandaşlık ve insan hakları Eğitimi amaçlarının gerçekleşme düzeyine ilişkin öğretmen öğrenci tutumlarının değerlendirilmesi. *Mustafa Kemal Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 8, 15-16.
- Öztürk, M. (2012). Coğrafya öğretmenlerinin post modern coğrafya algıları. Eğitim ve Bilim Dergisi, 37, 166-167.
- Pamuk, A. (2014). *Kimlik ve tarih*. İstanbul: Yeni İnsan Yayınevi.
- Patton, M. Q. (2014). *Qualitative research & evaluation methods*. Sage Publications.
- Quigley, C. N. (2000). Global trends in civic education. Center for civic education web sitesindeki. http://www.civiced.org/articles_indonesia.html adresinden, 05. 06. 2020 tarihinde alınmıştır.
- Sözer, E. (1998). Kuramdan uygulamaya sosyal bilimlerin öğretimi. Anadolu Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- Şimşek, H. (2014). *Türkiye'den Avusturya'ya göçün 50 yılı*. Belge Yayınları.
- Tekin, U. (2012). Unutulan tarih: Almanya'da Ford grevi. Ü. S. Fındıkçıoğlu & E. Z. Güler (Ed.). *Almanya'ya emek göçü* (71-83). İstanbul: Yazılama Yayınevi.
- Tezgel, R. (2008). Yeni ilköğretim programlarında insan hakları vatandaşlık ve kentlilik Eğitimi. Araştırma Yayınları.
- Türkyılmaz, M. (2008). Dil ve anlatım dersinde bir ölçme aracı olarak yazılı sınavların kullanımı konusunda öğretmen görüşleri. Ahi Evran Üniversitesi, Kırşehir Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 9 (3), 1-14.
- Ünlüer, G. (2008). Sosyal bilgiler dersinde gazete kullanımının öğrencilerin akademik ve tutumlarına etkisi (Doktora Tezi), YÖK Tez Merkezi. (257211).
- Yalçın, C. (2004). Göç Sosyolojisi. Anı Yayınları.
- Yıldırım, A., & Şimşek, H. (2018). Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri. Seçkin Yayınevi.